

CITY OF MUSKEGON
PLANNING COMMISSION
SPECIAL MEETING
MINUTES

January 23, 2003

P. Sartorius called the meeting to order at 4:08 p.m., and roll was taken.

MEMBERS PRESENT: M. Kleaveland, B. Mazade, S. Warmington, P. Sartorius, P. Veltkamp, J. Stewart, L. Spataro

MEMBERS ABSENT: J. Aslakson, excused; B. Smith

STAFF PRESENT: B. Moore, H. Griffith, M. Al-Shatel

OTHERS PRESENT: J. Clark, 433 Octavius; G. Adams, 15 Ionia; G. Mudler, President & CEO of Hackley Hospital; J. Strach, Director of Planning, Hackley Hospital; T. Metzdorf, Project Designer, BETA Design Group.

M. Kleaveland arrived at 4:09 p.m.

PUBLIC HEARINGS

Hearing; Case 2002-57: Request for a Special Use Permit to construct a new Emergency Center expansion at 1700 Clinton St., by Hackley Hospital. (tabled) P. Sartorius stated that at the last meeting, the Hackley team was asked to look at a different placement for the helistop. T. Metzdorf showed a display of the site. They had re-worked the plan per Mr. Sartorius' idea. The helistop and parking lots were "flipped". They have also increased the proposed landscaping. The helistop is located 52 ft. from Southern Ave. He gave an overview of the dimensions. B. Mazade asked about the hospital district language for the zoning ordinance referring a helistop as being 100 ft. from the property line. P. Sartorius stated that the language says from the nearest property line. M. Kleaveland added that it also states, unless otherwise approved by the Planning Commission. L. Spataro asked staff if a dollar amount had been determined for the relocating of the underground utilities. M. Al-Shatel stated the storm sewer could be relocated down Leahy and would cost roughly \$200,000. This is for the 2,000 ft. of 36-in. storm sewer only. P. Sartorius asked the cost per foot. M. Al-Shatel stated that it would be about \$100.00 per foot. B. Mazade asked if the size is a factor in the cost. M. Al-Shatel stated that it is. He added that if the sewer were to be moved, then he asks that a condition be added stating that the City has no liability in this movement. The City would want to be legally protected in case something was to happen because of the relocation of this. L. Spataro asked if the ER could function if there was a problem with one of the underground utilities. T. Metzdorf stated that they could. There would be a "bridge" connecting the ER to the rest of the hospital. This way, any problems with the utilities could be worked on while the ER is still functioning. L. Spataro stated that if the underground utilities were moved, then the new ER could be closer to the existing building. T. Metzdorf stated that it could be moved closer, but they would still

need to be sure that there is adequate fire access to the other portions of the existing building. There is a minimum requirement of 20 ft. by 20ft. space for fire access. He added that there is also a diesel fuel tank underground. L. Spataro stated that there could be a lot of potential problems with diesel and utilities. M. Kleaveland stated that he couldn't see how the costs involved with the movement of underground utilities would be cost effective when the only gain would be about 30 ft. M. Al-Shatel added that the sanitary sewer and water mains couldn't be relocated. L. Spataro stated that since this would be a new building, why the helistop can't be located on the roof of it. T. Metzdorf stated that it would run over one million dollars to place it on the roof. There would have to shatterproof glass for the windows and the structure itself would require different building materials. J. Strach added that most accidents occur on the rooftop sites.

J. Stewart stated that she is looking at the affect that this would have on the entire neighborhood. When something happens to one neighborhood, it spreads into other neighborhoods. She is concerned with the curb cut being so close to the intersection of Southern and Clinton. There are already traffic problems at this intersection. She felt that this would create more. She is concerned with the parking situation. She had looked at the hospital parking lots on Friday (1/17/03) around 11 a.m. The parking lot at Leahy and Larch was full with only about 11 spots available. In one of the other parking lots there was about 10 spots available. The parking situation affects the neighbors. There has already been four streets closed because of the hospital's needs. This has caused more traffic on the other surrounding streets. She is asking that the other commission members look at the affects this would have on not just one neighborhood, but all the neighborhoods and the City as a whole. B. Mazade stated that he understands her concerns. He felt that Hackley Hospital has tried to address the issues. They have done a great job trying to accomodate the needs. P. Sartorius asked about the parking plan. G. Adams stated that they would submit their findings to staff. P. Sartorius stated the parking plan would need to depict employee, client/patient, and delivery parking. He would also be happier if the curb cut were moved about 40 ft. to the east. T. Metzdorf stated that there is a barrier between the public and employee parking. This proposal is also closing a curb cut currently located on Clinton. L. Spataro stated that if it were moved as P. Sartorius suggested, then the hospital would lose about 9 to 10 parking spaces. P. Sartorius added that if it were moved, it would create more parking for the public. T. Metzdorf stated that they would be willing to make this change if the Planning Commission would like it done. J. Stewart asked if the parking plan would show the number of spaces according to what is required by the zoning ordinance. B. Moore stated that most of the hospital facility was in place prior to the change in parking rules. They would have to follow new parking standards for any future expansion. L. Spataro stated that he does still have some concerns with the location of the helistop. He acknowledged that some of the parking problem was because of County Mental Health (next door to the hospital) which doesn't have adequate on-site parking. G. Mudler stated that they would be willing to move the curb cut. M. Kleaveland stated that he would rather see the hospital work with staff and not have to go back before the Planning Commission for a fourth time.

A motion that the special use permit and associated site plan for a new Emergency Center Expansion at 1700 Clinton St. by Hackley Hospital be approved, based on compliance with the City's Master Land Use Plan and conditions set forth in Section 2315 of the City of Muskegon Zoning Ordinance based on the following conditions: 1) Supply a parking needs assessment for

the campus to staff for review prior to final site approval. Include a campus site plan with parking space totals by parking area. 2) Comply with utility requirements outlined by Department of Public Works. 3) Comply with emergency access and hydrant access requirements outlined by the Fire Marshall. 4) Outdoor lighting shall be “cut-off” fixtures to prevent glare on adjacent properties. 5) Landscape areas must be irrigated. 6) Mechanical equipment must be screened. 7) A performance guarantee for landscaping and tree preservation must be provided prior to the issuance of a building permit. 8) The curb cut on Southern Ave. would need to be moved to the east if determined with staff that that is the best approach, was made by B. Mazade, supported by M. Kleaveland and approved with L. Spataro and J. Stewart voting nay.

Hearing; Case 2002-58: Request for a Special Use Permit for a church at 1073 Evanston Ave., by Jim Clark. (tabled) B. Moore presented the staff report. The members were provided with a floor plan of the building. The Sanctuary has seating for 90 and would require 15 on-site parking spaces. The building is 45 ft. by 78 ft. and she believes that the parking as presented would be fine. On the record, Oakview Elementary Schools won’t enter into an irrevocable letter due to the liability that could be involved with this. Off the record, the public may use the parking lot, as it is public property. P. Sartorius asked how many parking spaces would be available for on street parking along Evanston. B. Moore stated that there would be about 10-15 additional parking spots available on-street.

A motion that the special use permit and associated site plan for a church at 1073 Evanston Ave. by Jim Clark “The Church” be approved, based on compliance with the City’s Master Land Use Plan and conditions set forth in Section 2315 of the City of Muskegon Zoning Ordinance based on the following conditions: 1) An updated site plan for the parking lot shall be submitted that reflects the preservation of the existing tree and a landscape plan that reflects species and sizes of plant materials. 2) The applicant will work with the Inspections Department on submitting any and all information required by that office. The building must meet current code requirements before any permits or certificate of occupancy will be issued. 3) Only a wall sign is permitted on site, was made by L. Spataro, supported by S. Warmington and unanimously approved.

OTHER

None.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 4:52 p.m.

hmg
1/23/03